# **Decomposition of litter produced under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>: Dependence on plant species and nutrient supply**

VALERIE M. FRANCK<sup>1</sup>, BRUCE A. HUNGATE<sup>1,3</sup>, F. STUART CHAPIN, III<sup>1,\*</sup> & CHRISTOPHER B. FIELD<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720–3140, USA; <sup>2</sup>Carnegie Institution of Washington, Stanford, CA 94305, USA; <sup>3</sup>Current address: Smithsonian Environmental Research Center, PO Box 28, Edgewater, MD 21037, USA; \*Corresponding author: Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720–3140, USA, tel: (510) 642–1003, fax: (510) 643–6264, e-mail: fschapin@garnet.berkeley.edu

Received 5 August 1996; accepted 30 July 1996

Key words: decomposition, elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, litter quality, nitrogen mineralization, serpentine grassland

Abstract. We investigated the effect of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and soil nutrient availability during growth on the subsequent decomposition and nitrogen (N) release from litter of four annual grasses that differ in resource requirements and native habitat. Vulpia microstachys is a native grass found on California serpentine soils, whereas Avena fatua, Bromus hordaceus, and Lolium multiflorum are introduced grasses restricted to more fertile sandstone soils (Hobbs & Mooney 1991). Growth in elevated  $\overline{CO}_2$  altered litter C:N ratio, decomposition, and N release, but the direction and magnitude of the changes differed among plant species and nutrient treatments. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> had relatively modest effects on C:N ratio of litter, increasing this ratio in Lolium roots (and shoots at high nutrients), but decreasing C:N ratio in Avena shoots. Growth of plants under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> decreased the decomposition rate of *Vulpia* litter, but increased decomposition of Avena litter from the high-nutrient treatment. The impact of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on N loss from litter also differed among species, with Vulpia litter from high-CO<sub>2</sub> plants releasing N more slowly than ambient- $CO_2$  litter, whereas growth under elevated  $CO_2$  caused increased N loss from Avena litter. CO<sub>2</sub> effects on N release in Lolium and Bromus depended on the nutrient regime in which plants were grown. There was no overall relationship between litter C:N ratio and decomposition rate or N release across species and treatments. Based on our study and the literature, we conclude that the effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on decomposition and N release from litter are highly species-specific. These results do not support the hypothesis that  $CO_2$ effects on litter quality consistently lead to decreased nutrient availability in nutrient-limited ecosystems exposed to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>.

## Introduction

Increases in  $CO_2$  emissions to the atmosphere since the mid-1800s have led to concentrations of atmospheric  $CO_2$  unequaled in the last 160,000 years (Post et al. 1990). In order to predict the long-term trajectory of atmospheric  $CO_2$ , we must understand the response of long-term carbon cycling to elevated  $CO_2$ . The two major control points in the terrestrial carbon cycle are carbon

gain by plant production and carbon release by decomposition. Of these two processes, the response of decomposition to elevated  $CO_2$  is less well understood but is crucial to predictions of long-term changes in carbon storage in ecosystems (Dixon & Turner 1991; Comins & McMurtrie 1993).

Litter quality plays a major role in controlling decomposition rate. Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> can affect litter quality by altering tissue concentrations of nutrients (Norby et al. 1986; Billes et al. 1990; Garbutt et al. 1990; Brown 1991; Mooney et al. 1991; Lindroth et al. 1993) or refractory compounds such as lignin (Norby et al. 1986; Bazzaz 1990; Lambers 1993) or by increasing the ratio of root litter to shoot litter (Cotrufo & Ineson 1995). Changes in initial litter quality under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> can also affect soil respiration rates and alter soil microfaunal interactions (Melillo et al. 1982; Coûteaux et al. 1991). Published studies of CO<sub>2</sub> effects on litter decomposition report a range from a 30% increase in decomposition to a 60% decrease, indicating that CO<sub>2</sub> effects on litter decay rates are sensitive to many factors, including initial litter quality (Cotrufo et al. 1994; Cotrufo & Ineson 1995), plant nutrient availability (Kemp et al. 1994), and soil fauna (Coûteaux et al. 1991; O'Neill 1994). Because most ecosystems exhibit some degree of nutrient limitation (Vitousek & Howarth 1991), the response of the biosphere to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> may be constrained by nutrient supply (Mooney et al. 1991; Shaver et al. 1992). Thus, an understanding of the interaction between nutrient levels and the CO<sub>2</sub> response of decomposition is critical to long-term predictions of ecosystem response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>.

The goal of this experiment was to determine the effect of rising atmospheric  $CO_2$  on plant litter quality and decomposition (litter C loss and N release) to predict more accurately the role of soil processes as biological feedbacks in the global carbon cycle. We examined this effect as a function of both soil nutrient level during plant growth and species traits. We hypothesized that elevated  $CO_2$  would reduce litter decomposition and N release, due to reduced litter quality (increased C:N ratio). We expected  $CO_2$  effects on C:N ratio to be particularly pronounced at high nutrient availability and in species with large growth responses to elevated  $CO_2$ .

#### Methods

We studied four annual grasses that differ in resource requirements and occurrence on nutrient-limited serpentine soil. *Vulpia microstachys* is native to California and is typically the dominant grass on California serpentine (Mooney et al. 1986; Huenneke et al. 1990). *Lolium multiflorum* and *Bromus hordaceus* are invasive European grasses that appear infrequently on serpentine soils but invade with fertilization (Huenneke et al. 1990). *Avena fatua*,

another invasive Mediterranean grass, is ubiquitous in California grasslands on more fertile soils but is normally absent on serpentine (Hickman 1993). These four species were chosen to characterize species effects on nitrogen release from decomposing litter in response to elevated  $CO_2$  and nutrient addition.

Plants were grown in open-top chambers at the Jasper Ridge Biological Preserve near Stanford, California, using the Microecosystems for Climate Change Analysis (Field et al. 1996). Each species was grown in monoculture in tubes 1 m deep and 20 cm in diameter in a 2-way factorial design (nutrients  $\times$  CO<sub>2</sub>) during the 1992–1993 growing season, with 7 replicates of each treatment. CO<sub>2</sub> treatments were ambient and ambient + 350 ppm CO<sub>2</sub>, and fertilization treatments were unamended serpentine soil and serpentine soil supplemented with 20 g/m<sup>2</sup> each of nitrogen, phosphorus, and potassium as Osmocote 120-day slow-release fertilizer. Comparable nutrient amendment increased aboveground biomass production to levels found in non-serpentine grasslands (McNaughton 1968; Turitzin 1982; Huenneke et al. 1990). Unamended soils had 3.8 mg N/g soil and 0.5 mg P/g soil (Kjeldahl digestion). Soil pH was 5.5–6.5 (Luo et al. 1994).

Seeds were sown in October 1992, and senescent plant roots and shoots were collected in May 1993 (the end of the growing season for these early-season annuals) for use in this decomposition study. Plant material was dried at 65  $^{\circ}$ C and weighed. A subsample of roots and shoots from each treatment was ground to a fine powder and analyzed for C and N content by combustion in an elemental analyzer (Roboprep, Europa Scientific). The remaining material from the 7 replicates of each treatment was mixed thoroughly (separate mixtures for shoot and root litter), and then 5 subsamples were removed from each mixture for this decomposition study.

Root and shoot litter from each species were allowed to decompose for 5 months in microcosms using the following experimental design (Hobbie, in press): The material was cut in 0.5 cm lengths, weighed, and placed into nylon mesh litter bags with separate compartments for roots and shoots (total root + shoot mass, 0.4 g/bag). Root and shoot material was partitioned according to the root:shoot ratio exhibited by each species growing under the treatment from which it was harvested (Table 1). Top-soil (top 20 cm) collected from a serpentine grassland at Morgan Hill, California, was air dried, sifted to remove rocks, and weighed (~65 g) into 1 L glass jars. The soil was then watered to approximately 65% of water-holding capacity and incubated for two weeks. Throughout incubation and during the entire experiment, the jars were covered with a fitted plastic film wrap (Handiwrap) that allowed exchange of CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> but prevented water loss. After the 2-week incubation, litter bags were placed midway between the soil surface and the bottom of the jar

	Plant root:shoot dry weight ratio				
	Unfertilized soil		Fertilized soil		
	350 ppm CO <sub>2</sub>	700 ppm CO <sub>2</sub>	350 ppm CO <sub>2</sub>	700 ppm CO <sub>2</sub>	
Avena	$0.49\pm0.09$	$0.43\pm0.03$	$0.33\pm0.01$	$0.33\pm0.03$	
Bromus	$0.73\pm0.14$	$0.77\pm0.07$	$0.44\pm0.04$	$0.51\pm0.04$	
Lolium	$0.56\pm0.08$	$0.94\pm0.09$	$0.39\pm0.04$	$0.45\pm0.06$	
Vulpia	$0.35\pm0.04$	$0.36\pm0.07$	$0.27\pm0.03$	$0.23\pm0.03$	

*Table 1*. Root:shoot dry weight ratios from four annual grasses grown in ambient and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and fertilized and unfertilized serpentine soil measured at the end of the growing season (data from Field et al., in preparation). Values are means  $\pm$  SE (n = 6 to 7).

(approximately 1 cm total soil thickness), with 5 replicate litter bags for each treatment.

The jars were incubated in the dark at 20  $^{\circ}$ C for five mo before harvest. Root and shoot litter was recovered separately, then oven dried (65  $^{\circ}$ C) and weighed. Litter samples were ground to a fine powder and analyzed for C and N content by combustion, gas-chromatography (Carlo-Erba).

It was difficult to remove mineral soil from the recovered litter samples, so the measured litter mass was corrected for mineral soil contamination based on the measured final litter %C (with mineral soil contamination), initial litter %C, and soil %C. Final litter mass was calculated assuming constant litter and soil %C.

Nitrogen release from the litter after the five months – presented as milligrams N per gram initial litter – was calculated by subtracting final litter N (final litter mass times final litter N concentration, both corrected as above for mineral soil contamination) from initial litter N (initial litter mass times initial litter N concentration).

Root and shoot C:N and whole-microcosm (root + shoot) litter decomposition and N release were analyzed in 3-way analyses of variance (ANOVAs) with CO<sub>2</sub>, nutrients, and species as the main effects. Data for all tests passed Cochran's test for homogeneity of variances (Winer et al. 1991). Because the CO<sub>2</sub> × Nutrient × Species interaction was significant for both decomposition and N release, each species was also analyzed separately in 2-way ANOVAs. Tukey's *post hoc* multiple range tests were used to compare the four species under common nutrient and CO<sub>2</sub> treatments. To determine differences between root and shoot decomposition and N release, and whether these responded differently to CO<sub>2</sub> and nutrient effects, litter decomposition and N release were also analyzed in 3-way split-plot ANOVAs, with main effects as above and plant fraction (root and shoot) as the within-plot effect.

	C:N shoots	C:N roots	Mass loss	Nitrogen loss
Source of variation	<i>P</i> -value			
CO <sub>2</sub>	0.933	0.043	0.099	0.512
NPK	0.054	0.001	0.021	0.417
Species	0.001	< 0.001	0.002	0.005
$CO_2 \times NPK$	0.427	0.391	0.036	0.725
$CO_2 \times Species$	0.037	< 0.001	< 0.001	< 0.001
NPK × Species	< 0.001	0.073	0.005	0.004
$CO_2 \times NPK \times Sp.$	0.044	0.096	0.017	< 0.001

*Table 2. P*-values from 3-way ANOVAs showing the effects of growth  $CO_2$  concentration, soil nutrient availability, and plant species on litter C:N, mass loss, and N release.

Pearson correlations were used to examine relationships between litter C:N, decomposition, and N release to determine whether differences in C:N ratio among species or treatments could explain the overall patterns in decomposition and N release that we observed. Because our major interest was in comparisons across species and treatments we used mean values of each parameter for each species-treatment combination. The correlation analysis was done separately for shoots and roots.

### Results

The effect of elevated  $CO_2$  on litter C:N ratio was relatively small and depended strongly on species ( $CO_2 \times$  species interactions; Table 2, Figure 1). Elevated  $CO_2$  caused the expected increase in litter C:N ratio only in *Lolium* shoots and roots and actually decreased shoot C:N in *Avena* at high nutrients (Table 3, Figure 1). Nutrient addition decreased C:N in *Avena* shoots and roots but increased C:N ratio in *Vulpia* shoots (Table 3, Figure 1)

Species differed in decomposition, but the differences depended on  $CO_2$ and nutrient treatments (Figure 2), as indicated by the strong  $CO_2 \times$  species interactions (Table 2). Differences were often especially strong between the native grass *Vulpia* and the three non-native species *Avena*, *Bromus*, and *Lolium*. Growth under elevated  $CO_2$  decreased decomposition in *Vulpia* at both nutrient levels but increased decomposition in *Avena* at high nutrients and in *Lolium* at low nutrients ( $CO_2 \times$  NPK interactions; Figure 2, Table 3). Nutrient addition increased subsequent decomposition of *Avena*, particularly in litter from high- $CO_2$ -grown plants and decreased subsequent decomposition in *Vulpia* litter from both  $CO_2$  levels, and of *Lolium* litter from high  $CO_2$  (Figure 2, Table 3). Decomposition of litter from ambient  $CO_2$  under



*Figure 1*. Effect of growth CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and soil nutrient (NPK) availability on (a) shoot and (b) root carbon to nitrogen ratio (gC/gN) at the end of the growing season. Data are means  $\pm$  SE (n = 5 to 7).

both nutrient conditions did not differ between Avena, Bromus and Lolium, but Vulpia litter decomposed significantly faster than the other three (Figure 2). In response to growth at low nutrients and elevated  $CO_2$ , Lolium litter decomposed the fastest, Avena litter the slowest, while Vulpia and Bromus litter were intermediate. Finally, for plants grown under elevated  $CO_2$  and high nutrients, litter decomposition did not differ among the four species. Thus, while species differed in litter decomposition, the nutrient and  $CO_2$ treatments often eliminated or even reversed these differences.

As with species differences in mass loss, N release from litter during decomposition varied strongly among species and nutrient treatments in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Figure 3, Table 2; CO<sub>2</sub> × NPK × species interaction). Indeed, the pattern for each species was unique. *Vulpia* litter from



*Figure 2.* Effect of growth CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and growth soil nutrient (NPK) availability on litter mass loss after 5 months of decomposition in (a) total (whole bag) litter, (b) shoot litter, and (c) root litter. Data are means  $\pm$  SE (n = 5). For total litter mass loss, means in the same CO<sub>2</sub> and nutrient treatment with a common letter do not differ (Tukey's *post hoc* multiple range test, P < 0.05).

	Source of variation				
	CO <sub>2</sub>	NPK	$CO_2 \times NPK$		
	<i>P</i> -value				
Shoot C:N					
Avena	0.020	0.004	0.121		
Bromus	0.819	0.931	0.181		
Lolium	0.009	0.698	0.010		
Vulpia	0.596	0.001	0.510		
Root C:N					
Avena	0.940	< 0.001	0.738		
Bromus	0.118	0.462	0.656		
Lolium	0.015	0.115	0.163		
Vulpia	0.115	0.105	0.313		
Mass loss					
Avena	0.063	0.012	0.046		
Bromus	0.077	0.337	0.245		
Lolium	0.007	0.112	0.010		
Vulpia	0.001	0.040	0.387		
N release					
Avena	0.004	0.001	0.006		
Bromus	0.585	0.657	0.019		
Lolium	0.549	0.263	0.001		
Vulpia	0.004	0.799	0.001		

*Table 3. P*-values from 2-way ANOVAs showing the effects of growth CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and soil nutrient availability on litter C:N, mass loss, and N release for 4 annual grasses.

high-CO<sub>2</sub> plants lost much less N (particularly from the low-nutrient treatment) compared to litter from low-CO<sub>2</sub> plants (Figure 3, Table 3; CO<sub>2</sub> × NPK interaction). The same inhibitory effect of CO<sub>2</sub> on N release was observed in *Lolium*, but only at high nutrients. In contrast, growth under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> dramatically increased N release from *Avena* litter, particularly in litter from the high-nutrient treatment and from *Bromus* litter (low-nutrient treatment only) (CO<sub>2</sub> × NPK interaction).

Nutrient addition also caused no simple overall effect in litter N release. Rather, changes under fertilization interacted with CO<sub>2</sub> and species (Table 2). In *Avena*, growth under high nutrients stimulated N release from litter, particularly in elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> litter (Figure 3, Table 3; CO<sub>2</sub> × NPK interaction). Nutrient addition increased N release from *Bromus* and *Lolium* litter from the ambient-CO<sub>2</sub> treatment, but decreased it in litter from the elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (CO<sub>2</sub> × NPK interaction). In contrast, nutrient addition decreased N release from *Vulpia* litter from the ambient-CO<sub>2</sub> treatment.



*Figure 3*. Effect of growth CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and growth soil nutrient (NPK) availability on N release from litter after 5 months of decomposition in (a) total (whole bag) litter, (b) shoot litter, and (c) root litter. Data are means  $\pm$  SE (n = 5). For total litter N release (a), means in the same CO<sub>2</sub> and nutrient treatment with a common letter do not differ (Tukey's *post hoc* multiple range test, P < 0.05). N release from the litter is represented by positive values; net N immobilization in litter (from soil) by negative values.

Though species differed in N release from litter, the direction and magnitude of these differences depended on the  $CO_2$  and nutrient treatments in which the litter was produced (Figure 3, Table 2). For example, of the four grasses at low nutrients, *Vulpia* had the highest N release from litter in the ambient- $CO_2$ , ambient-NPK treatment but relatively low N release from high- $CO_2$  litter (Figure 3). Of the four grasses grown at high nutrients, N release was highest from *Avena* litter in elevated  $CO_2$ , but was relatively low from *Avena* litter grown under ambient  $CO_2$ . Thus, growth  $CO_2$  and soil-nutrient conditions strongly determined species differences in N release from litter.

In general, root litter decomposed more slowly and released N more slowly than did shoot litter (p < 0.001 for the plant-part effect for each process in 3way split-plot ANOVA; detailed statistics not shown). However, rates of root and shoot litter decomposition and N loss were not different in some cases, and the magnitude of the difference varied among treatments (Figures 2, 3). For example, Vulpia litter did not differ in decomposition rate between roots and shoots, whereas root litter of Avena always decomposed more slowly than did shoot litter. The relative decomposition rate of roots and shoots depended on treatment in Bromus and Lolium. For all species except Vulpia, root litter released less N than did shoot litter (Figure 3); roots even immobilized N in some cases. In Vulpia, root litter released more N than shoot litter; Vulpia shoot litter immobilized N except in the ambient CO<sub>2</sub> and nutrient treatment (Figure 3). For the other three species, the magnitude of the difference between root and shoot N release was larger under some nutrient, CO<sub>2</sub>, and species combinations. In summary, although roots decomposed and released N more slowly than shoots in most cases, the magnitude of this difference depended on species, nutrients, and CO<sub>2</sub> treatments.

Litter C:N was a poor predictor of mass loss and N release. Shoot C:N explained 21% of the variance in shoot N release (P = 0.04), with higher shoot C:N corresponding with lower N release. In contrast, shoot C:N was not significantly related to shoot mass loss (P = 0.67), nor was root C:N significantly related to mass loss (P = 0.16) or N release (P = 0.70). Thus, in our experiment where there were relatively small treatment and species differences in C:N ratio, factors in addition to tissue C:N must have contributed to species differences in mass loss and litter N release and to changes in these parameters caused by nutrients and elevated CO<sub>2</sub>.

### Discussion

Perhaps the most striking result of our study was the strong difference among species in the effect of elevated  $CO_2$  on subsequent litter decomposition and N release, even though all study species were annual grasses grown under the

same conditions. Contrary to our initial hypothesis, litter from plants grown under elevated  $CO_2$  often decomposed more rapidly than did litter of ambient- $CO_2$ -grown plants. This occurred at high nutrients in *Avena* and at ambient nutrients in *Bromus* and *Lolium*. The stimulation of decomposition by growth under elevated  $CO_2$  may reflect accumulation of carbohydrates or other labile carbon substrates. Only the native grass *Vulpia* showed the expected decrease in mass loss from litter produced under elevated  $CO_2$ . Similarly, the effects of elevated  $CO_2$  on N release were complex, depending on soil nutrient availability and plant species. Growth of plants under elevated  $CO_2$  caused litter to release N more rapidly in *Avena* and more slowly in *Vulpia*, although, for all species, the  $CO_2$  effect on N release was strongly affected by nutrient treatment.

Previous studies also show conflicting evidence for reduced decomposition and N mineralization rates in high-CO2-grown litter. Boerner & Rebbeck (1995) report a decrease in both mass loss and in N release in yellow poplar leaves from seedlings grown in elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Cotrufo & Ineson (1995) report a decrease in mass loss of elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> birch roots but no change in elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> spruce roots. Kemp et al. (1994) found no significant effects of elevated CO2 on decomposition of Andropogon gerardii, Sorghastrum nutans, and *Poa pratensis* litter produced in tallgrass prairie. Norby & O'Neill (1991) also found no significant effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on the decomposition of Populus leaf litter. Finally, Coûteaux et al. (1991) report a retarded weight loss of elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> sweet-chestnut leaf litter decomposed in soil fauna of low diversity but an increased weight loss with more complex soil fauna. Because species differ so strongly in CO<sub>2</sub> effects on decomposition, there is currently little support for the hypothesis that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> will consistently reduce nutrient availability in ecosystems through reductions in litter quality (Bazzaz 1990; Field et al. 1992; Boerner & Rebbeck 1995), particularly when CO<sub>2</sub> has relatively small effects on C:N ratio.

The significant differences between shoot and root litter in C:N ratio, decomposition rate, and N release suggest that responses of litter decomposition and N release to elevated  $CO_2$  may be strongly influenced by root:shoot ratio, which depends on species traits and nutrient availability as well as  $CO_2$  level.

Past studies of litter decomposition of elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> litter have shown litter C:N ratio to be a good predictor of mass loss and nutrient release rates (Taylor et al. 1989; Cotrufo et al. 1994). Cotrufo & Ineson (1995) found that initial litter C:N accounted for 63% of the variation in mass loss in elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> litter from birch and spruce roots, and was a better predictor of mass loss than %N. Studies involving C:N ratios in elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> litter have reported a range of results, including no change in leaf-litter quality (Norby & O'Neill 1991);

an increase in shoot C:N but no change in root C:N (Chu et al. 1992); and an increase in root C:N in both low N environments (Curtis et al. 1990; Barnes & Pfirrmann 1992; Kohen et al. 1992; Cotrufo & Ineson 1995) and high N environments (Kohen et al. 1992; Diaz et al. 1993). In our study, the CO<sub>2</sub> effects on initial litter C:N were relatively small so that other (unmeasured) factors apparently exerted greater effect on decomposition and N release. For example, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> caused a decline in lignin concentration of Avena fatua (Chu et al., in press). Similarly, there was no effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on C:N ratio of aboveground litter of the total community in California serpentine and sandstone grasslands (Hungate et al., in press a), and Kemp et al. (1994) found species differences to be a greater controlling factor than changes in litter chemistry for litter decomposition and nutrient release in elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> litter. In summary, our results and the literature do not support predictions that CO<sub>2</sub>-induced declines in foliar N content will result in consistent and predictable decreased litter decomposition and nutrient release rates (Field et al. 1992; Lambers 1993; Boerner & Rebbeck 1995).

The strong species differences in CO<sub>2</sub> effects on decomposition and N release from litter that we observed have important implications for future changes in species composition of annual grasslands in California. Because Bromus can invade serpentine soil when nutrient availability is high (Huenneke et al. 1990), elevated CO<sub>2</sub> could favor its success by increasing litter turnover and N release. In contrast, because Vulpia can thrive at extremely low nutrient levels characteristic of serpentine soil (Huenneke et al. 1990), decreased N release from Vulpia litter in elevated CO2 could reduce the ability of Bromus to invade serpentine, favoring Vulpia. The relative importance of these opposing CO<sub>2</sub> effects on N release during decomposition will depend on the CO<sub>2</sub>-stimulation of biomass for these species, and on how these species compete under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, and thus their respective contributions to the litter pool. The invasive species tend to show a larger biomass response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Hungate et al., in press b), suggesting that the positive feedback to nutrient availability through increased decomposition of Bromus litter may override the negative feedback to nutrient availability through decreased decomposition in Vulpia litter. If so, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> has the potential to replace fertilization as a window through which Bromus could invade serpentine grassland. As serpentine grasslands are one of the few repositories of native California grasses (Huenneke et al. 1990), such changes in species composition could have important implications for conservation.

#### Acknowledgments

We thank Christopher Brown, Natasha Burroughs, Megan Fulmer, Joyce Kwan, Matthew Twist, Stan Schug, and David Shen for many hours in the laboratory and for their intellectual contributions, our colleagues at the Microecosystems for Climate Change Analysis facility for providing the litter used in these experiments, Hailin Zhong for laboratory assistance, and Valerie Eviner for critical review of the manuscript. We thank the Undergraduate Research Apprenticeship Program at the University of California for facilitating and partly funding this research. The Jasper Ridge CO<sub>2</sub> Experiment is supported by grants from the US National Science Foundation to the Carnegie Institute of Washington (DEB 90-20134), Stanford University (DEB 90-20347), and the University of California, Berkeley (BEG 90-20135).

### References

- Barnes JD & Pfirrmann T (1992) The influence of  $CO_2$  and  $O_3$ , singly and in combination, on gas exchange, growth and nutrient status of radish (*Raphanus sativus*). New Phytol. 121: 403–412
- Bazzaz FA (1990) The response of natural ecosystems to the rising global CO<sub>2</sub> levels. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 21: 167–196
- Billes G, Rouhier H & Bottner P (1990) Modifications of the carbon and nitrogen allocations in the plant (*Triticum aestivum* L.) soil system in response to increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. Plant Soil 157: 215–225
- Boerner REJ & Rebbeck J (1995) Decomposition and nitrogen release from leaves of three hardwood species grown under elevated O<sub>3</sub> and/or CO<sub>2</sub>. Plant Soil 170: 149–157
- Brown KR (1991) Carbon dioxide enrichment accelerates the decline in nutrient status and relative growth rate of *Populus tremuloides* Michx. seedlings. Tree Physiol. 8: 161–173
- Chu CC, Coleman JS & Mooney HA (1992) Control of biomass partitioning between roots and shoots: Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment and the acquisition and allocation of carbon and nitrogen in wild radish. Oecologia 89: 580–587
- Chu CC, Field CB & Mooney HA (in press) Effects of CO<sub>2</sub> and nutrient enrichment on tissue quality of two California annuals. Oecologia
- Comins HN & McMurtrie RE (1993) Long-term response of nutrient-limited forests to CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment: equilibrium behavior of plant-soil models. Ecol. Appl. 3: 666–681
- Cotrufo MF & Ineson P (1995) Effects of enhanced atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and nutrient supply on the quality and subsequent decomposition of fine roots of *Betula pendula* Roth. and *Picea sitchensis* (Bong.) Carr. Plant Soil 170: 267–277
- Cotrufo MF, Ineson P & Rowland AP (1994) Decomposition of tree leaf litters grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>: Effect of litter quality. Plant Soil 163: 121–130
- $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{Coûteaux M-M, Mousseau M, Celerier M-L \& Bottner P (1991) Increased atmospheric CO_2 \\ \mbox{and litter quality: Decomposition of sweet chestnut leaf litter with animal food webs of \\ \mbox{different complexities. Oikos 61: 54-64} \end{array}$
- Curtis PS, Balduman LM, Drake BG & Whigham DF (1990) Elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  effects on belowground processes in  $C_3$  and  $C_4$  estuarine marsh communities. Ecology 71: 2001–2006
- Diaz SA, Grime JP, Harris J & McPherson E (1993) Evidence of a feedback mechanism limiting plant response to elevated carbon dioxide. Nature 364: 616–617

- Dixon RK & Turner DP (1991) The global carbon cycle and climate change: Responses and feedbacks from below-ground systems. Environ. Pollu. 73: 245–262
- Field C, Chapin FS III, Matson PA & Mooney HA (1992) Responses of terrestrial ecosystems to the changing atmosphere: A resource-based approach. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 23: 201–235
- Field CB, Chapin FS III, Chiariello NR, Holland EA & Mooney HA (1996) The Jasper Ridge CO2 experiment: Design and motivation. In: Koch GW & Mooney HA (Eds) Carbon Dioxide and Terrestrial Ecosystems (pp 121–145). Academic Press, San Diego
- Garbutt K, Williams WE & Bazzaz FA (1990) Analysis of the differential response of five annuals to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> during growth. Ecology 71: 1185–1194
- Hickman JC (1993) The Jepson Manual, Higher Plants of California. University of California Press, Berkeley
- Hobbie SE (in press) Temperature and plant species' control over litter decomposition in Alaskan tundra. Ecology
- Hobbs RJ & Mooney HA (1991) Effects of rainfall variability and gopher disturbance on serpentine annual grassland dynamics. Ecology 72: 59–68
- Huenneke LF, Hamburg SP, Koide R, Mooney HA & Vitousek PM (1990) Effects of soil resources on plant invasion and community structure in Californian serpentine grassland. Ecology 71: 478–491
- Hungate BA, Canadell JC & Chapin FS III (in press) Plant species mediate changes in microbial N in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Ecology
- Hungate BA, Chapin FS III, Zhong H, Holland EA & Field CB (in press) Stimulation of grassland nitrogen cycling under carbon dioxide enrichment. Oecologia
- Kemp PR, Waldecker DG, Owensby CE, Reynolds JF & Virginia RA (1994) Effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and nitrogen fertilization pretreatments on decomposition on tallgrass prairie leaf litter. Plant Soil 165: 115–127
- Kohen EI, Rouhier H & Mousseau M (1992) Changes in dry weight and nitrogen partitioning induced by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> depend on soil nutrient availability in sweet chestnut (*Castanea* sativa Mill.). Ann. Sci. For. 49: 83–90
- Lambers H (1993) Rising CO<sub>2</sub>, secondary plant metabolism, plant-herbivore interactions and litter decomposition. Vegetatio 104: 263–271
- Lindroth RL, Kinney KK & Platz CL (1993) Responses of deciduous trees to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>: Productivity, phytochemistry and insect resistance. Ecology 74: 763–777
- Luo Y, Field CB & Mooney HA (1994) Predicting responses of photosynthesis and root fraction to elevated [CO<sub>2</sub>]: Interactions among carbon, nitrogen, and growth. Plant Cell Environ. 17: 1195–1204
- McNaughton SJ (1968) Structure and function of California grasslands. Ecology 49: 962-972
- Melillo JM, Aber JD & Muratore JF (1982) Nitrogen and lignin control of hardwood leaf litter decomposition dynamics. Ecology 63: 621–626
- Mooney HA, Drake BG, Luxmoore RJ, Oechel WC & Pitelka LF (1991) Predicting ecosystem responses to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. BioScience 41: 96–104
- Mooney HA, Hobbs RJ, Gorham J & Williams K (1986) Biomass accumulation and resource utilization in co-occurring grassland annuals. Oecologia 70: 555–558
- Norby RJ & O'Neill EG (1991) Leaf area compensation and nutrient interactions in CO<sub>2</sub>enriched seedlings of yellow-poplar (*Liriodendron tulipifera* L.). New Phytol. 117: 515– 528
- Norby RJ, Pastor J & Melillo JM (1986) Carbon-nitrogen interactions in CO<sub>2</sub>-enriched white oak: Physiological and long term perspectives. Tree Physiology 2: 233–241
- O'Neill EG (1994) Responses of soil biota to elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide. Plant Soil 165: 55–65
- Post WM, Peng T-H, Emanuel WR, King AW, Dale VH & DeAngelis DL (1990) The global carbon cycle. Am. Sci. 78: 310–326

- Shaver GR, Billings WD, Chapin FS III, Giblin AE, Nadelhoffer KJ, Oechel WC & Rastetter EB (1992) Global change and the carbon balance of arctic ecosystems. BioScience 61: 415–435
- Taylor BR, Parkinson D & Parsons WFJ (1989) Nitrogen and lignin as predictors of litter decay rates: A microcosm test. Ecology 70: 97–104
- Turitzin SN (1982) Nutrient limitations to plant growth in a California serpentine grassland. Am. Midl. Nat. 107: 95–99
- Vitousek PM & Howarth RW (1991) Nitrogen limitation on land and in the sea: How can it occur? Biogeochemistry 13: 87–115
- Winer BJ, Brown DR & Michels KM (1991) Statistical Principles in Experimental Design. McGraw-Hill, Inc., New York, New York, USA